

Jon
FILED

SEP 23 2003

LARRY W. PROPES, CLERK
CHARLESTON, SC

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
DISTRICT OF SOUTH CAROLINA
ROCKHILL DIVISION**

ENTERED
9/23/03
SCANNED

ROBERT W. RATTERREE

JUDGMENT IN A CIVIL CASE

vs.

Case Number: 0:99-2630-24BD

NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICAL,
CORPORATION, as Successor in Interest to
SANDOZ PHARMACEUTICAL CORPORATION

[X] Decision by Court. This action came to trial before the Court, the Honorable Bristow Marchant, presiding. The issues have been duly tried and a decision has been duly rendered.

IT IS ORDERED AND ADJUDGED that defendants' motion for Judgment as a matter of law is hereby granted, that each party bear their own costs and that this action is hereby dismissed.

LARRY W. PROPES, Clerk

By *Patricia M. Chialin*
Deputy Clerk

September 23, 2003